High School Career and Technical Education

Serving Pennsylvania’s Student and Workforce Needs

February 2016 Report from The Education Policy and Leadership Center

PA Cooperative Education Association
October 19, 2016
Introduction to Report

• Report released 2/10/16 at PACTA Symposium.
• Cooperation and input for 30+ member Study Group.
• 43 actionable recommendations – something for everyone to do.
• Specific about “who” should do “what”.
• Use policy levers and build on current requirements/policies where practical.
• Intended to prompt discussion and action.
• Focused on the interest of students.
Organized Around 7 Broad Topics

• Leadership and Governance
• Regional & Local Coordination
• Student & Parent Awareness
• Relevancy and Rigor
• Assuring CTE Opportunities for All Students
• Accountability for Effectiveness
• State Funding
Summary of Findings

• High School CTE takes many forms.
• CTE leadership comes from various entities.
• High School CTE needs to be an integral and strategic part of workforce development planning at the state and local level.
• There are many positive and exciting changes occurring.
• But progress is not happening everywhere.
• Not all students have access to high quality, job- and career-relevant CTE opportunities.
• Key issues are image, leadership, and funding.
Governor should …..

• direct state cabinet-level officials who oversee relevant agencies to develop & implement a **strategic plan** to support & promote high-quality CTE opportunities for all students.

• (and the State Senate) assure the **State Board of Education** includes at least two members on each of the two councils of the board who have meaningful experience with CTE, as intended by language currently in the School Code.

• assure that at all times one or more appointed members of the **State WDB** has current or recent experience as a secondary level CTE instructional leader or administrator.
• At least once a year, the State WDB and SBE should meet together to consider CTE and other education/workforce development issues.

• State law should be amended to allow the board of directors of a CTC to appoint no more than two individuals representing business and private employer perspectives as additional board members with voting authority.

• A review of the state’s Perkins Plan and state CTE programs and policies should be initiated by the SBE and PDE as soon as practical.
• The State Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Plan submitted to U.S. Department of Labor in March 2016, and the periodic revisions that are permitted thereafter, should reflect how CTE for high school students will be supported and strengthened as an integral part of the state’s workforce development strategies.

• Organizations representing employers should routinely encourage their members to serve on local boards of school directors, the governing boards of regional career and technical centers, and occupational advisory committees for secondary CTE programs.
Regional/Local Cooperation

• Governor & Legislature should consider applying conditions and expectations to funding for districts, IU’s, CTC’s, higher ed, and WDB’s to require funding recipients to demonstrate participation in regional & local partnerships for planning and delivering CTE programs for high school students and others.

• Every local WDB should include at least one administrator of a CTC, an IU and a school district, and, where present in the region, at least one administrator of a community college, state system university, and private licensed career college or school.

• L&I or DCED should offer competitive grants to regional business-education partnerships to develop and implement regional strategies to deliver CTE programs to high school students and others.
Awareness and Image

• Public-private partnership should develop & implement a **statewide public awareness campaign** to promote the importance of CTE and multiple career pathways available to students, including CTE.

• Superintendents & board members should assure that all **middle school & high school students, and their parents, are regularly informed** about the multiple career pathways available to students, depending on the individual student’s interests and capabilities.
Superintendents & board members, working with administrators and the governing boards of regional CTC’s, should adopt policies & practices that assure every middle school student will have at least one orientation presentation and visit to a regional CTC to observe and to explore the programs and opportunities available to high school students.

Statewide associations representing board members, administrators, principals, teachers, & school counselors should incorporate into professional development activities for members multiple opportunities to develop greater awareness of CTE programs and related workforce opportunities for students.
• School boards and boards of CTC’s should ensure there are **sufficient school counselors** in middle schools, high schools, and CTC’s to provide appropriate career pathway information to all students and their parents.

• PDE should develop & maintain a **one-stop on-line resource center** about CTE for students, parents, educators, school leaders, and others.

• The Governor & Secretary of Education should ensure at least **one full-time position in PDE** dedicated to working with school counselors.
Relevancy and Rigor

• L&I in partnership with the local WDB’s should periodically review the quality, accessibility and utility of labor market data provided to state agencies, school districts, CTC’s, higher education, WDB’s and other workforce development organizations.

• PDE should routinely identify and disseminate information about effective CTE programs and best practices, serving as a reliable resource for CTE policymakers, administrators, and faculty.
• PDE and the board of directors of each school district and each CTC should **conduct CTE program review, evaluation, and revision processes** to ensure CTE programs are relevant and reflect the labor market demands of the district and CTC regions.

• All approved secondary CTE programs should provide the opportunity for their students to earn **recognized industry related certifications or credentials** that lead to increased employability.

• **Also see Recommendations 10, 11, and 12 concerning Regional Coordination.**
CTE Opportunities for All

• The superintendent and board of every district should ensure that their district fulfills the obligation to integrate Career Education and Work standards throughout the curriculum for all students.

• Every district should clearly articulate in its comprehensive planning a commitment to multiple career pathways available to its students, and how the district will ensure every student has the opportunity to pursue a career pathway appropriate to the student’s interests and capabilities. The school board should hold the superintendent and itself publicly accountable for the implementation of this commitment.
• Every district should articulate in its comprehensive planning the **professional development** that will be provided to assure all educators, administrators, and board members are informed about CTE needs and opportunities that are or should be available to students. The board should hold the superintendent & itself accountable for implementation of these professional development plans.

• The Legislature should require every district and CTC to enter into any necessary agreements that will enable any student the option to attend any secondary-level career and technical program that is not available to them under existing agreements.
• The Legislature should encourage every community college, PASSHE university, and private licensed career college and school, to enter into dual enrollment agreements with school districts and CTC’s, and to report to the Secretary of Education annually all such dual enrollment agreements.

• The Legislature should encourage every community college and every PASSHE university, and private licensed career college and school, to enter into articulation agreements with school districts and CTC’s that will establish predictable and industry relevant pathways for students to move from high school to postsecondary education to career, and to report to the Secretary of Education annually all such pathways agreements.
• School districts, CTC’s, and postsecondary education institutions should strategically work together to maximize CTE awareness and opportunities for students, including collaboration relative to programs, facilities, and faculty.

• SBE and PDE should revise requirements for administrator preparation programs to assure that these programs promote CTE awareness for every educator seeking superintendent certification.
• PDE should include in its **online menu of professional development** for teachers, school counselors, and administrators courses that promote awareness and capacity building to support CTE opportunities for all students.

• Organizations representing employers should routinely encourage their members to create **opportunities for high school students to have real work experiences** through internships, apprenticeships, work co-ops, and summer employment.
Accountability

• PDE’s School Performance Profile (SPP) report card should be revised to additionally report on career and technical education information such as: a) number of students successfully completing NOCTI exams and the number of NOCTI exams successfully completed; b) the percentage of students for whom an individual career and work plan has been developed by the 8th grade; and c) how many students complete a CTE program with an industry recognized credential.
• The Legislature should require each school district to periodically report publicly about how the statewide Career Education and Work standards for students are implemented in their district.

• PDE and L&I, using student data and wage record data, while respecting the anonymity of individual students), should establish a data system and protocol to report on the effectiveness of CTE programs and to provide guidance for subsequent policy-making by school and public policy leaders.
Funding

• Governor & Legislature should annually fund a statewide K-12 education finance system that is based on the principles of equity, adequacy, predictability, and accountability.

• The Select Committee of the House of Reps. in its report due in 2016 should address the responsibility of the Legislature to provide more sufficient financial resources to support CTE at the secondary level in order to address serious underfunding issues.
• Governor & Legislature should amend the new Basic Education Funding Formula to reflect an added weight factor for CTE enrollment as a basic component of the cost of education for all school districts.

• Governor & Legislature should provide an annual increase in the CTE line item in the state budget at least equal to the annual published “index” increase allowed for school district revenues.

• The Governor & Legislature should provide for an annual appropriation of at least $10 million for equipment purchases for CTE programs.
• The Governor & Legislature should enact and annually fund a five-year School Counseling Improvement Program designed to assist school districts to enhance career counseling, with an emphasis on building more awareness among students and their parents concerning CTE opportunities.

• Governor & Legislature should amend the Educational Improvement Tax Credit (EITC) program to provide for a separate category of tax credits for eligible taxpayers to support CTE equipment purchases, and to fund this category with an additional EITC allocation so as to not reduce current allocations for any other EITC categories.
Challenge State Policymakers to Use All the Policy Levers Available to Support CTE

Bully-pulpit
Convener
Appointing Authority
Statutes
Regulations
Planning
State Funding
Conditions Attached to Funding
What You Can Do

• Raise profile of CTE at every opportunity
• Appointments and Elections
• Distribute to more stakeholders
• Talk with more state policymakers
• Upcoming report of House Select Subcommittee
• Discuss at local WDB meetings
• Raise at school board meetings
• Join us for media visits
• Other ideas?
# PUBLIC K-12 SPENDING

## Per Pupil Amounts for Current Spending 2013-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>$11,009</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>$13,961</td>
<td>11th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: US Census Bureau – 2016
PUBLIC K-12 SPENDING

CURRENT EXPENDITURES PER STUDENT – 2013-14

Compared to contiguous states, spending in Pennsylvania was in the middle of the pack --- exceeding Ohio and West Virginia, about the same as Delaware and Maryland, and trailing New Jersey and New York.

- Pennsylvania $13,961
- National 11,009
- Delaware 13,938
- Maryland 14,003
- New Jersey 17,907
- New York 20,610
- Ohio 11,354
- West Virginia 11,260

Source: US Census Bureau – June 2016
## State/Local Shares

Elementary/Secondary Public Education Revenue in 2013-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Share %</th>
<th>Local Share %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>37.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>46.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware</td>
<td>59.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>44.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>40.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>40.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>42.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Virginia</td>
<td>58.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*PA ranked 46th in nation.*

Source: US Census Bureau and USDE – 2016

1% in PA in 2014-2015 = approximately $280 million
# State Funding Appropriated Per Student

*Source: US Census Bureau June 2016*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013-2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State $ per pupil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>5,969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>6,399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE</td>
<td>9,432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
<td>7,146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NJ</td>
<td>8,275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY</td>
<td>9,477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OH</td>
<td>5,927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WV</td>
<td>7,257</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESULT: 2013-14 Burden on Local Property Taxes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total K-12 State-wide Revenues</th>
<th>Local K-12 Property Taxes</th>
<th>% from Prop Taxes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>$617,633,773</td>
<td>$179,987,314</td>
<td>29.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>$27,647,475</td>
<td>$12,476,890</td>
<td>45.12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

($ in ooo’s)

Source: US Census Bureau – 2016

15.98% Difference = $4.418 billion/year
RESULT: Inequity for Students Across PA

Great Inequity for Students Among 500 Districts

In 2013-14, current spending per pupil in Pennsylvania school districts ranged from $9,515 (Juniata County SD) to $23,535 (Lower Merion)

This means, in an average classroom of 25 students, a gap of $350,500 per classroom per year.

Inequitable and Inadequate Resources in a Standards-Based Environment with Equal Expectations for All Students
State Support for Higher Education – 2013-2014

Per $1000 of Personal Income:
National - $5.45
Pennsylvania - $3.02 – Ranked 48th
(Behind CO, MA)
(DE $5.44; MD $5.42; NJ $3.99; NY $4.91; OH $4.42; WV $7.80)

Per Capita:
National - $241.66
Pennsylvania - $138.64 – Ranked 47th
(Behind only NH, AZ, CO)
(DE $245; MD $293; NJ $223; NY $264; OH $181; WV $278)

“Educated Citizen” Cuts in Recent Years to Education-Related Items

- K-12 Basic Ed and Other Supports
- Higher Ed
- Early Ed
- State Library
- Public Library Subsidy
- State Museum
- Museum Assistance Grants
- Grants to Arts Organizations
What Are Impacts of Cuts or Inadequate Funding

• On Public Education System (P-16)?
  • On Equal Opportunities?
  • On an Educated Citizenry?
  • On an Educated Workforce?

• On the well-being of communities and the Commonwealth?
Contact Information

Download free copy of report and find this presentation on EPLC website at [www.eplc.org](http://www.eplc.org)

Ron Cowell
717-260-9900
cowell@eplc.org
Facebook
@RonaldCowellPA

The Education Policy and Leadership Center
800 North Third Street, Suite 408
Harrisburg, PA 17102
www.eplc.org
Facebook
@eplc_education